



Evaluating Integrity and Transparency Assessment in the Operations of Local Government Organizations Under the criteria of indicators Measuring External Integrity and Transparency Assessment: A Case Study of Local Government Organizations in Mueang District Maha Sarakham Province

Warit Rasri^{1*}, Somsak Promduea², Somchao Bamrungchai³ and Man Kanyarat⁴

^{1*}Faculty of Social Administration and Social Development Program Rajabhat Maha Sarakham University

^{2,3,4}Special Lecturer, Social Administration and Social Development Program, Rajabhat Maha Sarakham University, Thailand

Corresponding Author Email: sonowa_cmu.com ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0648-6489>

Email: Somsak.p@gmail.com, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0006-4193-0716>

Email: Somchao_rmu@gmail.com, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0007-3903-8080>

Email: P.mane101@gmail.com, ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0009-0008-6686-0130>

Received 24/06/2023

Revised 11/07/2024

Accepted 10/08/2024

Abstract

Background and Aim: A case study of local government organizations in Mueang District, Maha Sarakham Province, was conducted to assess the integrity and transparency of their operations using external integrity and transparency assessment indicators. The purpose of this evaluation is to collect important data for the advancement and development of local administrative operations. The organization can improve its procedures and serve the public more effectively and efficiently by examining the assessment results.

Materials and Methods: The sample was 399 citizens of the municipal area of Mueang District, Maha Sarakham Province, and were chosen as a sample sampling with an error of 0.05. One of the research instruments utilized was a three-part questionnaire: Part 1 of the survey asked questions about the respondents' general characteristics. Part 2 used a 5-point rating scale to assess the integrity and transparency of the local administrative organization's operations based on indicators provided by external stakeholders. Part 3 used open-ended questions to gather additional feedback and recommendations. A pre-made descriptive statistics program was used for the statistical analysis to compute means, standard deviations, and percentages.

Results: 1. Based on external stakeholder indicators, the local administrative organization in Mueang District, Maha Sarakham Province, is evaluated for integrity and transparency in its operations. The study includes the following case study: (1) Overall, the quality of work is high. (2) Overall high level of communication efficiency. And (3) High-level overall work system improvement. 2. A case study of the local administrative organization in Mueang District, Maha Sarakham Province, revealed the following recommendations for evaluating integrity and transparency in the operations of the local administrative organization under external stakeholder indicators: (1) Public participation (upstream, midstream, and downstream). (2) The creation of impartial auditing and assessment systems. (3) Easy access to information and its transparent disclosure. (4) Development of skills and knowledge of staff in evaluation. And (5) Results evaluation and application of evaluation findings for operational enhancement.

Conclusion: According to the study, the local government in Mueang District, Maha Sarakham Province, operates with a high degree of integrity, transparency, and efficiency. Enhancing public involvement, setting up unbiased auditing systems, guaranteeing transparent information access, training employees, and implementing evaluation results to improve operations are among the suggestions for additional improvement.

Keywords: Integrity and Transparency Assessment; Local Government Organizations

Introduction

The assessment of integrity and transparency in government agency operations, also known as the Integrity and Transparency Assessment (ITA) ITA assessment, another name for it, is one instrument used to influence state policy. As a tool Positively, rather than criticizing, it seeks to innovate

[637]





the Thai bureaucracy. It resembles a yearly organizational health assessment tool. The aim is to raise awareness among government agencies across the nation regarding the state and challenges associated with conducting business ethically and transparently. The evaluation's findings will assist government organizations in making improvements. Make the organization's operations more efficient so that it can facilitate services and better serve the needs of the people. This is thought to improve the caliber of operations in the public sector. Therefore, in addition to evaluating morality and transparency, the ITA assessment also assesses the effectiveness of work and public service to identify areas of injustice and inefficiency and to develop various preventative measures against misconduct and corruption in Thai bureaucracy.

Furthermore, government agencies are said to use the ITA assessment as a tool for self-evaluation. to obtain knowledge that raises awareness and enhances effective operation management and oversight. Help the populace and provide the ethics and openness of one's organization are given more weight. Furthermore, the ITA assessment has led to appreciable advancements and modifications in government agencies' day-to-day operations. In particular awareness and focusing on creating more contemporary and engaging content for their electronic platforms. Significantly, this leads to the agency organizing, planning, and managing information methodically. In releasing data to the public for recognition and encouraging further research.

The ITA assessment for fiscal year 2024 has improved the important assessment details, namely reducing the number of questions in the I IT measure, EIT measure, and OIT measure to be concise, which will be sent. As a result, the NACC has made efforts to develop the ITA assessment to be more inefficient by listening to opinions and gathering opinions from various stakeholders. As a result, the questions' score values can more accurately represent the agency's moral and transparent concerns. Furthermore, to improve efficiency, agencies must create and distribute information at a higher level of disclosure. Increasing the amount of information that the agency discloses, especially critical information like procurement data that the agency is required to provide in the form of an Excel file that can be processed with You are free to use the computer as usual (Office of the National Anti-Corruption Commission, 2024).

Given the aforementioned concepts and their significance The Integrity and Transparency Assessment: ITA has been examined by the researcher. It is a procedure for keeping tabs on and assessing how ethically and transparently government agencies operate. The purpose of this evaluation is to instill public trust in the openness and equity of government agency operations. Including encouraging work that is morally and politically pure. Information disclosure is one of many criteria that cover the work in different areas of the agency in the ITA assessment. Involvement of the public, handling of conflicts of interest, etc. Because ITA assessments are instruments that enhance the effectiveness and transparency of government agency operations, they are significant. They support agencies in identifying operational flaws and weaknesses. And results in the creation of solutions for issues. Additionally, the ITA assessment increases public trust in state administration, which is a crucial component in fostering positive ties between the government and the populace, among other things.

Therefore, the researcher is interested in conducting experimental research under the fiscal year 2024 on the Integrity and Transparency Assessment (ITA), which uses the External Stakeholder Scale to evaluate morality and transparency in government agency operations. Integrity and Transparency Assessment: EIT, also known as the "EIT measure," is a gauge of how external stakeholders are perceived. Respondents can select an answer on this measure according to their perceptions. The goal is to gather data on how external stakeholders view the evaluated agencies about three indicators: indicators of operational quality, indicators of communication efficiency, and indicators for enhancing the working system, which the researcher will develop into a measurement model. Five-level Rating Scale (Rating Scale) There will be case studies in the Mueang District area as well as experimental research with local administrative organizations (Local Administrative Organizations). Province of Maha Sarakham. After the study is finished, the researcher will publish the findings so that local and federal government organizations can compare and utilize them as guidelines. It will be utilized to plan



and enhance the agency's future operations, as well as to enable citizen participation and the ability to assess the agency's transparency. Which encourages examination in a variety of ways.

Objectives

1. To analyze the level of evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations. Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area of Maha Sarakham Province
2. To study suggestions Evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province

Literary Review

In this research, the researcher has studied and reviewed the literature related to the research as follows.

1. Rights, freedoms, and duties of citizenship according to the principles of the 2017 Constitution

The Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand, B.E. 2017, is the highest law of Thailand, effective from 6 April 2017. This constitution aims to ensure fairness and transparency in the political process. Including promoting people's rights, freedom, and equality. The structure and duties of various agencies in the administration of the country are also determined. To ensure efficient state operations and the rule of law, another important issue in the 2017 Constitution is the promotion and protection of people's rights and freedoms. It specifies various rights that people should receive, such as the right to express their opinions. Access to news information and participation in political decision-making. In addition, there are guidelines to protect the rights of those who have been accused or imprisoned. To ensure that the justice process is fair and transparent. This constitution also places importance on protecting the rights of disadvantaged groups and people with disabilities. This includes promoting gender equality and protecting the environment. etc.

The rights and freedoms of Thai citizens have been provided in Section 3 Rights and freedoms of the Thai people as follows:

Section 25 Rights and freedoms of the Thai people in addition to those specifically protected by the law already in the constitution Anything that is not prohibited or restricted in the Constitution or other laws. A person has rights. And the freedom to do so is protected according to the Constitution. As long as the exercise of rights or freedom such that it does not affect or endanger the security of the state. Peace and good morals of the people and do not violate the rights or freedoms of others.

What rights or freedoms does the Constitution provide as provided by law? or according to the criteria and how does the law provide Even though that law has not yet been enacted into force? An individual or community can exercise those rights or freedoms according to the spirit of the Constitution.

Section 26 The enactment of laws that have the effect of limiting the rights or freedoms of individuals must be by According to the conditions provided in the Constitution In the case where the Constitution does not provide conditions Such law Must not violate the rule of law. Do not increase the burden or limit the rights or freedoms of individuals more than is reasonable. And will not affect the human dignity of a person Including the need to specify the reason for the restriction of rights. And freedom as well Law according to paragraph one Must have a general effect. It is not intended to apply to any case. In a specific case or to a specific person

Section 27 All persons are equal before the law. Have rights and freedoms and be protected. According to the law, equally Men and women have equal rights. Unfair discrimination against individuals whether due to differences in place of origin, race language, gender, age, disability, physical condition health Person's status economic or social status religious beliefs, education, or political opinions that do not violate the provisions of the Constitution. or any other reason, it cannot be done. Measures established by the state to remove obstacles or encourage individuals to exercise their rights





or freedoms. The same as other people or to protect or facilitate children, women, the elderly, and disabled people. Or the underprivileged It is not considered unfair discrimination according to paragraph three. Persons who are soldiers, police, civil servants, and other government officials. Employees or employees of the organization Members of the state have the same rights and freedoms as ordinary people. Except as limited by law in specific areas. Concerning politics, competence, discipline, or ethics

Section 28: Every person has the right and freedom to life and body. Arrest and detention of persons shall not be carried out unless there is an order or warrant of the court or there is another reason. As provided by law Searching a person or any action that affects the right or freedom of life or body cannot be done unless there is a reason specified in the law.

The duties of citizenship according to the principles of the 2017 Constitution It is provided in Section 4. The duties of the Thai people are as follows:

Section 50: A person has the duties to 1) Protect and preserve the nation, religion, and monarchy. And democratic governance with the King as Head of State 2) defends the country to protect the honor of national interest and public property of the country Including cooperation in preventing and mitigating public disasters. 3) Strictly following the law. 4) Attending compulsory education and training. 5) Serving in the military as provided by law. 6) Respecting and not violating rights and the freedom of others and not doing anything that may cause Disunity or hatred in society. 7) Go freely to exercise your right to vote or vote in a referendum, taking into account the general interest of the country. 8) Cooperate and support the conservation and protection of the environment. Natural resources, diversity Biological including cultural heritage 9) Pay taxes as provided by law. and 10) Do not cooperate with or support any form of corruption and misconduct.

2. The concept of public participation (Public Participation)

It's a procedure that invites people to participate in the choices made and the workings of government departments or organizations. This involvement is crucial to fostering acceptance and understanding of the unit's operations. The public is given a chance to voice their opinions during the event. Share knowledge and provide recommendations for problem-solving techniques It will contribute to more fairness and transparency in operations. It also encourages citizens and agencies to share responsibility.

The levels of public participation are multifaceted. A fundamental step that agencies should take is to provide information and listen to opinions. This can range from informing and consulting to engaging in decision-making and operations (collaborating and empowering). This is done to give the public a chance to voice their opinions and comprehend the various projects or activities. There is more involvement in operations and decision-making. The public will be involved in setting policies and keeping an eye on implementation.

Participation by citizens also has a lot of advantages, like improving operations' transparency and reliability. Lowering tensions and fostering understanding between parties A further factor in sustainable development is participation. This is because operations that follow a participatory process frequently consider the requirements and viewpoints of all parties involved. Public engagement also encourages social learning and education. Increase public knowledge of government agency management and decision-making.



Methodology

This research is Quantitative Research The research method is as follows.

1. Population and sample groups in the research include:

1.1 Population includes people living in the Mueang District area. Maha Sarakham Province, 158,821 people

1.2 The sample group includes people living in the Mueang District area. Maha Sarakham Province, 399 people That comes from using the formula of Yamane (1973) by setting the sampling error equal to 0.05.

2. **Research tools include:** includes a questionnaire (Questionnaire) consisting of Part 1: the general status of the respondents. It is in the form of a survey, part 2, a questionnaire, level of evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations. Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area of Maha Sarakham Province, is a rating scale (Rating Scale) of 5 levels and part 3, opinions and other suggestions are open-ended (open-ended) as well as the researcher has brought a questionnaire to find out the quality of the tool, including 1) lead the questionnaire met with a consultant and was revised according to the recommendations. 2) The revised questionnaire was presented to 3 experts to check the consistency of the content by estimating the consistency of the objectives with the questions (Index of Item - Objective Congruence: IOC) (Luan Saiyot and Angkana Saiyot, 25 43, p. 249) found that the IOC value was between 0.80 - 1.00 and 3) testing the tool with a non-sample population of 30 sets, which the evaluation results had discriminatory power between 0.25 - 0.75 and find the confidence value of the questionnaire using Cronbach 's method (1990; Cited in Bunchom Srisa-at, 2015) which the confidence evaluation results have a confidence value of 0.95.

3. **Data collection** includes collecting data from primary data collection. (Primary Data) is information obtained by using a questionnaire. The research sample is people living in the Mueang District area. Maha Sarakham Province, 399 people That comes from using the formula of Yamane (1973) by setting the sampling error equal to 0.05.

4. **Data analysis** includes data analysis, including quantitative data analysis. By taking the data obtained from the distribution of questionnaires and analyzing them using a research statistical program.

5. **Statistics used** in the research include a ready-made descriptive statistics program consisting of percentage mean and standard deviation.

Results

Research on Evaluating Integrity and Transparency Assessment in the Operations of Local Government Organizations Under the criteria of indicators Measuring External Integrity and Transparency Assessment: A Case study of Local Government Organizations in Mueang District Maha Sarakham Province the results as follows:

1. Level analysis Evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province

The results of the research found that the level of evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province The researcher can classify the results according to Table 1-3 as follows.



Table 1 Mean and standard deviation of operational quality indicators

Operational quality	\bar{x}	SD	Meaning	Ranking
1 Officials of organizations that perform work or provide services to Service recipients According to the steps and duration	3.85	0.38	High	3
2 Officials, organizations, performing work or providing services to you and the Service recipient equally	4.30	0.42	High	1
3 Organization/ Official Accepting bribes in exchange for performing work or providing services	4.00	0.44	High	2
Total	4.05	0.41	High	

From Table 1, it is found that the level of evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province Operational Quality The overall picture is at a high level ($\bar{x} = 4.05$, $SD = 0.41$) And when considered individually in order from highest to lowest average. Including 1) officials, organizations, performing work or providing services to you and Service recipient Equally ($\bar{x} = 4.30$, $SD = 0.42$) Organization/ Official Requesting a bribe in exchange for performing a job or providing a service ($\bar{x} = 4.00$, $SD = 0.44$), Officials of organizations that perform work or provide services to Service recipient according to steps and duration ($\bar{x} = 3.85$, $SD = 0.38$) respectively.

Table 2 Mean and standard deviation of Communication efficiency indicators

Communication efficiency	\bar{x}	SD	Meaning	Ranking
1 Organization/ Agency There are channels for disseminating information that are easily accessible.	3.94	0.43	High	2
2 Organization/ Agency There are public relations. Information that citizens or service recipients should know.	4.10	0.46	High	1
3 Corporate officer Able to communicate, answer questions, or give explanations to People who come to use the service clearly	3.78	0.39	High	3
Total	3.94	0.43	High	

From Table 2, it is found that the level of evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province Communication Efficiency The overall picture is at a high level ($\bar{x} = 3.94$, $SD = 0.43$) And when considered individually in order from highest to lowest average. Namely 1) Organization/ Agency There is public relations. Information that citizens or service recipients should know ($\bar{x} = 4.10$, $SD = 0.46$) 2) Organizations/ agencies There are channels for disseminating information that is easily accessible ($\bar{x} = 3.94$, $SD = 0.43$) and Corporate officer Able to communicate, answer questions or provide explanations to People who come to use the service clearly ($\bar{x} = 3.78$, $SD = 0.39$) respectively.



Table 3. Mean and standard deviation of indicators for improving work systems.

Improving the working system		\bar{x}	SD	Meaning	Ranking
1	The organization/ agency provides opportunities for outsiders to participate in improving and developing the operations of the agency.	4. 44	0. 43	High	1
2	Organization/ Agency Operations have been improved to respond to the public.	4. 10	0. 48	High	3
3	Organizations/ agencies have an online service system (E-Service)	4. 34	0.45	High	2
Total		4.29	0.45	High	

From Table 3 , it is found that the level of evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province In terms of improving the work system, the overall picture was at a high level (\bar{x} = 4.29, SD = 0. 45) And when considered individually in order from highest to lowest average. Including 1) The organization/ agency has opportunities for outsiders to participate in improving and developing the operations of the agency (\bar{x} = 4.44, SD = 0. 43) 2) Organizations/ agencies have an online service system. (E-Service) (\bar{x} = 4.34, SD = 0. 45) and 3) organizations/ agencies Operations have been improved to respond to the public. (\bar{x} = 4.10, SD = 0. 48) respectively

2. To study suggestions Evaluation of morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province found that recommendations for evaluating morality and transparency in the operations of local government organizations Under the criteria of indicators measuring external stakeholders Case study of local government organizations In the Mueang District area Maha Sarakham Province consists of;

2.1 Public participation (upstream, midstream, and downstream) calls for the local government body to regularly convene meetings to hear what the general public has to say. Including conducting opinion surveys using internet tools. For all citizen groups to be able to access it and take part in voicing their opinions. Participation from the public will aid in making operations transparent and in line with community needs. Ever since the inception of the planning and assessment processes, etc.

2.2 Creation of a separate system for inspection and assessment in other words, an independent committee or external auditing system should be in place within the local government. To improve evaluations' dependability and transparency Reducing overlapping interests and boosting confidence in the evaluation process can be achieved by involving experts or civil society organizations in the monitoring and evaluation process.

2.3 Information disclosure that is clear and accessible In other words, since local government organizations distribute this information via a variety of platforms, including the agency website, it is necessary for them to compile reports that provide an overview of their operations and assessments. Mass communication or public announcement to facilitate easy access to information and transparent operation monitoring for the general public.

2.4 Enhancing the abilities and expertise of the assessment personnel That is, staff members engaged in assessment and inspection should receive training and skill development. To be familiar with and comprehend the accurate, standardized evaluation process. A competent workforce will contribute to the assessment's increased accuracy and dependability.

2.5 Assessment and application of assessment findings to enhance operations In other words, operations should be continuously monitored and assessed. And utilize the evaluation's findings to enhance and advance the operations of regional administrative organizations. For example, incorporating the evaluation's findings into regional development plans can help make these



organizations' operations more effective and responsive to the needs of the community by using the evaluation's findings as a tool for problem-solving and development.

Discussion

Investigations into the Assessment of Integrity and Transparency in Local Government Operations Using Indicator Criteria The following are the findings of the study Measuring External Integrity and Transparency Assessment: A Case Study of Local Government Organizations in Mueang District Maha Sarakham Province: For several reasons, it is essential to evaluate the honesty and openness of local administrative organizations' operations using indicators provided by external stakeholders.

First of all, it increases public confidence and trust. The administration's credibility is increased when the public perceives that their local government is dedicated to moral behavior and open communication. This trust is essential to good governance because it promotes collaboration and public involvement. Transparent operations also lessen the possibility of wrongdoing and corruption, resulting in an administration that is more accountable and responsible.

Second, this kind of evaluation encourages inclusivity and community involvement. Local governments can obtain a variety of viewpoints and insights from the community by including outside parties in the evaluation process. Because of this inclusivity, diverse groups' needs and concerns are taken into account, resulting in more equitable and knowledgeable decision-making. Active members of the public are more likely to make positive contributions to their communities by offering insightful criticism and backing for regional projects and laws.

Finally, the ongoing development of local governance is aided by the evaluation of integrity and transparency through the use of external indicators. Local administrations can use the actionable insights provided by external stakeholder feedback to improve their policies and practices. Frequent assessments push local governments to uphold high standards of integrity and transparency by fostering a culture of self-evaluation and accountability. The community as whole benefits in the end from this ongoing improvement since it results in more effective and efficient public service delivery.

It is imperative to take into account several aspects emphasized in the research when assessing integrity and transparency assessment in the operations of local government organizations based on the indicators measuring external integrity and transparency assessment. Research highlights the value of a methodical approach to integrity, suggesting enhancements in organizational integrity support, long-term awareness, and more precise definitions of integrity management (Hoekstra et al., 2022). Furthermore, studies highlight the value of openness in local government operations, emphasizing the usefulness of information released, particularly concerning design concerns and mobile accessibility (Macêdo et al., 2024) Moreover, disparities in the degree of adherence among Spanish municipalities are revealed by contrasting various transparency indices, underscoring the necessity for impartial instruments to precisely gauge transparency (Garrido-Rodríguez et al, 2022). Additionally, public opinions of local government's financial statements reveal difficulties in comprehending accounting data, indicating the need for more straightforward reporting formats to improve accountability and transparency (Haustein & Lorson, 2022).



Recommendation

1. Enhancing Transparency and Credibility: The outcomes of the evaluation of the views of external stakeholders can be utilized to improve the transparency of local administrative organizations' operations. Publicly releasing data and assessment findings will contribute to increased public credibility and trust.

2. Improving and Developing Management Systems: The management systems of regional administrative organizations can be developed and enhanced with the help of the assessment's recommendations. By using these suggestions as a guide, operations can be made more efficient, corrupt practices can be avoided, and unfair practices can be stopped. The evaluation's findings can also be used as instruments for future planning and policy.

3. Promoting Public Participation: Assessing the opinions of external stakeholders promotes public involvement in local government. Public participation guarantees that local governments can address the needs and problems of the community efficiently. In addition, the public and local government are encouraged to share responsibility when citizens participate in the evaluation process.

4. Promoting Organizational Culture of Integrity: Integrity and transparency are fostered within an organization when assessment results are put to use for developing and improving operations. Maintaining moral principles within the company fosters a happy workplace and results in better public services.

5. Building a Positive Public Image: Result disclosure and transparent evaluation contribute to a positive public perception. Transparent and ethical local administrative organizations are embraced and trusted by the public as well as other sectors of society. Long-term local development and collaboration are facilitated by this favorable perception.

References

- Cronbach, L. J. (1990). *Essentials of Psychological Testing*. 5th edition. New York: Harper & Row.
- Garrido-Rodríguez, J.C., Garrido-Montañés, M., López-Pérez, G., & Zafra-Gómez, E. (2022). The Importance of Measuring Local Governments' Information Disclosure: Comparing Transparency Indices in Spain. *Sustainability*. 14(20), 13081. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su142013081>.
- Haustein, E., & Lorson, P.C. (2022). Transparency of local government financial statements: Analyzing citizens' perceptions, *Financial Accountability & Management*, ISSN 1468-0408, Wiley, Hoboken, NJ, 39 (2), 375-393. <https://doi.org/10.1111/faam.12353>
- Hoekstra, A., Huberts, L., & Montfort, A.J.G.M. (2022). Content and Design of Integrity Systems: Evaluating Integrity Systems in Local Government. *Public Integrity*. 25(4), 1-13. DOI:10.1080/10999922.2021.2014204
- João, Marcelo, Alves, Macêdo., Valdecir, Becker., Felipe, Melo, Feliciano, De, Sá. (2023). Heuristic-Based Evaluation of Transparency Websites of the Municipal Governments Viewed on Web and Mobile Browsers. *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, 434-454.
- Macêdo, J.M.A., Becker, V., de Sá, F.M.F., da Rocha Filho, E.V., Cavalcanti, D.d.Q. (2024). Public Transparency in Brazil: Evaluation of Transparency Websites and Portals of Local Governments with More Than 200 thousand Inhabitants. In: Marcus, A., Rosenzweig, E., Soares, M.M. (eds) *Design, User Experience, and Usability. HCII 2024. Lecture Notes in Computer Science, vol 14712*. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-61351-7_19.
- Office of the National Anti-Corruption Commission. (2024). *Manual for evaluating morality and transparency in operations of government agencies (Integrity and Transparency Assessment: ITA)*. Retrieved on 15 December 2023, From https://www.amlo.go.th/acoc/uploads/content_attachfile/5ebcb34429cd8.pdf
- Saiyot, L., & Saiyot, A. (2000). *Measuring affective aspects*. Bangkok: Suviriyasan
- Srisa-ard, B. (2015). *Basics of educational research*. 7th edition. Kalasin: Taksila Printing.
- Yamane, T. (1973). *Statistics: An Introductory Analysis*. 3rd Edition, Harper and Row: New York.

